Loss of fan cowl, Airbus A320-233, July 13, 2004

Micro-summary: This Airbus A320-233 lost a fan cowl on takeoff.

Event Date: 2004-07-13 at 1200 EDT

Investigative Body: National Transportation Safety Board (NTSB), USA

Investigative Body's Web Site: http://www.ntsb.gov/

Cautions:

1. Accident reports can be and sometimes are revised. Be sure to consult the investigative agency for the latest version before basing anything significant on content (e.g., thesis, research, etc).

- 2. Readers are advised that each report is a glimpse of events at specific points in time. While broad themes permeate the causal events leading up to crashes, and we can learn from those, the specific regulatory and technological environments can and do change. Your company's flight operations manual is the final authority as to the safe operation of your aircraft!
- 3. Reports may or may not represent reality. Many many non-scientific factors go into an investigation, including the magnitude of the event, the experience of the investigator, the political climate, relationship with the regulatory authority, technological and recovery capabilities, etc. It is recommended that the reader review all reports analytically. Even a "bad" report can be a very useful launching point for learning.
- 4. Contact us before reproducing or redistributing a report from this anthology. Individual countries have very differing views on copyright! We can advise you on the steps to follow.

Aircraft Accident Reports on DVD, Copyright © 2006 by Flight Simulation Systems, LLC All rights reserved.

www.fss.aero

National Transportation Safety Board		NTSB ID:	ATL04IA156		Aircraft Registration Number: N951LF				
FACTUAL REPORT	C	Occurrenc	ce Date: 07/13	3/2004	Most Critical In	jury: No	one		
AYIATION ETYBON	C	Occurrenc	e Type: Incide	ent	Investigated By: NTSB				
Location/Time									
Nearest City/Place	State	Zip	p Code Local Time		Time Zone	Zone			
Atlanta	GA 30		320	1200	EDT				
Airport Proximity: On Airport Distance From L			anding Facility:		Direction From Airport:				
Aircraft Information Summary									
Aircraft Manufacturer			Model/Series	3		Type of Aircraft			
Airbus Industrie			A320-233			Airplane			
		,		·					

Sightseeing Flight: No

Air Medical Transport Flight: No

Narrative

Brief narrative statement of facts, conditions and circumstances pertinent to the accident/incident:

On July 13, 2004, about 1200 eastern daylight time, an Airbus Industrie A320-233, N951LF, operated by Ryan International Airlines, Inc., as AirTran Airways Flight 4, returned for landing after the fan cowl doors of the No. 1 engine separated from the airplane in flight in the vicinity of Atlanta, Georgia. The scheduled domestic air carrier flight was operated under the provisions of Title 14 CFR Part 121 with an instrument flight plan filed. Visual meteorological conditions prevailed. The airline transport-rated captain, airline transport-rated first officer, four flight attendants, and 104 passengers were not injured, and the airplane sustained minor damage. The flight departed Hartsfield-Jackson Atlanta International Airport, Atlanta, Georgia, at 1140 on July 13, 2004.

The captain stated he performed a preflight inspection of the airplane and noticed no irregularities. The flight departed runway 27R en route to Orlando, Florida. According to the captain, immediately after takeoff, the lead flight attendant called to inform him that a passenger reported seeing a "cover" come off the left [No. 1] engine. The captain received no cockpit indications of a problem, and the captain instructed the lead flight attendant to look out the window and verify. The captain stated he then felt the airplane "shutter," and he contacted air traffic control and requested to return for landing. The lead flight attendant confirmed to the captain the No. 1 engine fan cowl was missing. The captain stated the No. 1 engine oil quantity indicator illuminated amber, and he declared an emergency. The captain stated the engine continued to operate normally, and the flight returned for landing without further incident.

Examination of the airplane revealed both sides of the No. 1 engine fan cowl were separated, the engine pylon cantilever was bent up, aft, and inboard; and the left wing slat outboard of the engine nacelle displayed an approximate 12-inch area with dent and puncture damage. The Union City Police Department retrieved the inboard fan cowl door from a dirt roadway approximately 7.5 nautical miles west southwest of Hartsfield-Jackson Atlanta International Airport. Airport authorities found the outboard fan cowl door in the grass beside runway 27R. Examination of the latching mechanism components on each cowl door revealed no evidence of failure or mechanical malfunction. Examination of the No. 2 engine fan cowls revealed they were closed and latched.

A mechanic who performed a daily check on the airplane prior to the accident flight stated he opened the fan cowl for the No. 1 engine to check on what appeared to be an oil leak. The mechanic stated he found no leak and was in the process of closing the fan cowl when he was called away to another aircraft. The mechanic later returned to the incident airplane to finish the maintenance checks, and he stated he could not recall if the cowl doors on the No. 1 engine were fully latched.

A review of data provided by the Transportation Safety Board (TSB) of Canada revealed that, between 1991 and September 2000, there were ten similar cowl door separation events involving Airbus single-aisle aircraft series documented worldwide. According to TSB report A0000199, "All of the occurrences happened at rotation, and in every instance the engine cowls had been opened prior to

National Transportation Safety Board
FACTUAL REPORT
AVIATION

NTSB ID: ATL04IA156

Occurrence Date: 07/13/2004

Occurrence Type: Incident

Narrative (Continued)

the occurrence flight."

Federal Aviation Administration Airworthiness Directive (AD) 2003-18-06 amendment 39-13297, applicable to certain models of Airbus Industrie airplanes including the A320-233, mandates the installation of a hold-open device for the cowl doors, and it mandates a modification of the latch handles to ensure that unfastened latch handles will hang down. Examination of the incident airplane revealed the handle modifications and hold-open devices were installed on the No. 1 and No. 2 engine cowls, the forward handle on each cowl was painted orange, and the three aft handles on each cowl were painted orange on the surfaces exposed when in the unlatched hanging configuration.

A review of the operator's A320/321 preflight checklist revealed it included for each engine, "Check the fan cowl doors." During examination of the incident airplane, a visual walk-around was performed with the undamaged No. 2 engine cowl in various unlatched configurations. The examination revealed unlatched cowl doors can appear closed flush upon visual walk-around inspection when the hold-open device is overridden in preparation for latching. Examination of the undamaged No. 2 engine fan cowl also revealed unfastened latches that hang down may be obscured from view by the shape of the fan cowl; the unfastened latches are visible when a specific inspection of the latches is conducted (i.e., the person conducting the inspection can view the latches by bending, crouching, or stepping back from the fan cowl).

In response to the incident, on August 5, 2004, Airbus Industrie issued an Operator's Information Telex, reference number SE 999.0088/04, to "A319/A320/A321 V2500 operators." The telex referenced the incident and stated, "the purpose of this telex is to remind all operators ... of Airbus recommendations and available modifications that have been developed to prevent fan cowl loss events." The telex recommended that, in addition to mandatory compliance with AD 2003-18-06, operators consider the following: "4.1 Maintenance Recommendations ... strictly adhere to AMM Task 71-13-00 for proper latching and closing of fan cowl doors after each maintenance action requiring cowl opening. 4.2 Operational Recommendations ... It is essential that a flight crew member visually inspects the fan cowl doors prior to each flight to ensure that they are closed and latched. 5. Improvements ... fluorescent paint on the forward cowl door latch handles (IAE SB V2500-NAC-71-0227) [and] caution decal on the outboard fan cowl doors (IAE SB V2500-NAC-71-0235)."

National Transportation Safety Board
FACTUAL REPORT
AVIATION

NTSB ID: ATL04IA156

Occurrence Date: 07/13/2004

AVIATION			Occurrence Type: Incident										
Landing Facility/Approach In	formation												
Airport Name			Airpo	rt ID:	Airport Elev	ation	Run	way Used	Runwa	ay Lengt	th	Runv	way Width
Hartsfield-Jackson Atlanta Int			KAT	L	1026 F	t. MSL	_ NA	L					
Runway Surface Type:													
Runway Surface Condition:													
Type Instrument Approach: Unknown	own												
VFR Approach/Landing: Precaution	nary Landing												
Aircraft Information													
Aircraft Manufacturer Airbus Industrie				Model/s A320-						Serial 460	Numbe	er	
Airworthiness Certificate(s): Transport													
Landing Gear Type: Retractable	- Tricycle												
Homebuilt Aircraft? No	Number of Seats:	166	- (Certified Max Gross Wt.					169754 LBS Number			er of Engines: 2	
Engine Type: Turbo Fan	-	Engine Manufacturer: Model/Series: V2500-EA5									ed Power: 000 LBS		
- Aircraft Inspection Information													
Type of Last Inspection			Date	Date of Last Inspection Time Sin				nce Last Insp	pection		Airfrar	ne To	otal Time
Continuous Airworthiness			05/	05/2004 520 H						ours 32672.4 Hours			72.4 Hours
- Emergency Locator Transmitter (ELT) Information												
ELT Installed? No	ELT Operate	ed?				EL.	T Aided i	n Locating A	ccident S	Site?			
Owner/Operator Information													
Registered Aircraft Owner				Street A		h Mai	n Street	t					
First Security Bank Utah NA T	City Salt Lake City								Stat	te	Zip Code 84111		
Salt Lake City 01 84111 Street Address											01111		
Operator of Aircraft			_		266 No	rth Ma	ain Stree	et					
Ryan International Airlines, Inc	City Wichita							Stat KS	te	Zip Code 67202			
Operator Does Business As: AirTran Airways					Operator Designator Code: RYNA								
- Type of U.S. Certificate(s) Held:													
Air Carrier Operating Certificate(s)	Flag Carrier/Don	nestic											
Operating Certificate:					Operator	Certifi	cate:						
Regulation Flight Conducted Unde	r: Part 121: Air Ca	arrier											
Type of Flight Operation Conducted	d: Scheduled; Dor	mestic	; Pas	senger	Only								
		FACT	UAL	REPO:	RT - AVIA	TION							Page 2

National Transportation Safety Board
FACTUAL REPORT
AVIATION

NTSB ID: ATL04IA156

Occurrence Date: 07/13/2004

	AVIA	Occurrence	ce Type: Ind	cident										
First Pilo	t Informatio	n												
Name						City				,	State	Date	of Birth	Age
On File						On File	9				On File	On	File	36
Sex: M	Seat Occup	ational	nal Pilot Certificate Number: On File											
Certificate((s): A	irline Transpoi	t; Commerc	ial										
Airplane R	ating(s): M	lulti-engine La	nd; Single-e	ngine Land										
Rotorcraft/	Glider/LTA: N	one												
Instrument	Rating(s): A	irplane												
Instructor F	Rating(s): N	one												
Type Ratin	g/Endorsemer	nt for Accident/Ir	ncident Aircra	ft?			С	urrent Bie	nnial Flig	ht Rev	view? 06	/2004		
Medical Cert.: Class 1 Medical Cert. Status: With Waivers/Limitations									Date of	of Last	Medical	Exam:	02/2004	
- Flight Tin	ne Matrix	All A/C	This Make and Model	Airplane Single Engine	Airplane Mult-Engine	Nigh	t	Ins Actual	Instrument al Simulated		Rotorcraft		Glider	Lighter Than Air
Total Time		5800	730		5800									
Pilot In Cor	mmand(PIC)	2000	730		2000									
Instructor														
Last 90 Da	ys	159	159		159									
Last 30 Da	ys	56	56		56									
Last 24 Ho	urs	5	5		5	<u> </u>					<u> </u>			
Seatbelt Used? Yes Shoulder Harness Used? Yes Toxicology Performed? No Second Pilot? Yes										S				
Flight Pla	an/Itinerary													
Type of Flig	ght Plan Filed:	IFR												
Departure Point								Ai	rport Ider	port Identifier Departure			Time	Time Zone
Atlanta							GA	K	ATL		114	1140		EDT
Destination							State	Ai	rport Ider	port Identifier				
Orlando							FL		MCO					
Type of Cle	earance: IFR										_			
Type of Air	space:													
Weather	Information	<u> </u>												
Source of		known												
Method of	Briefing:													
				FACTUAL	REPORT	- AVIA	TION	1						Page 3

National Transportation Safety Board FACTUAL REPORT

NTSB ID: ATL04IA156

Occurrence Date: 07/13/2004

	AYLATION		Occurrence	e Type:	Incident								
Weather	Information												
WOF ID	Observation Time	Time Zone	WOF Elevati	WOF Elevation WOF Distance From Accide					ident Site Direction From Accident Site				
KATL	1153	EDT	1026 Ft.	MSL				0 NM			Deg	g. Mag.	
Sky/Lowes	st Cloud Condition: Few				3	000 Ft. AG	iL	Condition o	f Ligh	nt: Day			
Lowest Ce	iling: None		Ft.	AGL	Visibi	lity:	10	SM Altimeter: 30.03				"Hg	
Temperatu	ıre: 29 °C	Dew Point:	23 °C	Wind	Direction:	310	Density Altitude:					Ft.	
Wind Spee	Wind Speed: 10 Gusts: 15 Weather Condtion						dent S	ite: Visual C	Cond	itions			
Visibility (R	RVR): Ft.	Visibility (R)	/V)	SM	Intensity	of Precipita	ation:						
Restriction	s to Visibility: No Obsc	curation; No Pre	cipitation										
Type of Pre	ecipitation:												
Accident	Information												
Aircraft Dar	mage: Minor	Aircraft Fire	e: None	<u> </u>			Aircraft Exp	losio	n None				
Classificati	on:												
- Injury Su	mmary Matrix	Fatal Sei	rious Mino	or	None	TOTAL		.					
First Pi	lot				1	1							
Second	d Pilot				1	1							
Studen	t Pilot												
Flight II	nstructor												
Check	Pilot												
Flight E	Engineer												
Cabin A	Attendants				4	4							
Other C	Crew												
Passen	ngers				104	104							
- TOTAL A	ABOARD -				110	110							
Other C	Ground												
- GRAND	O TOTAL -				110	110							

National Transportation Safety Board

FACTUAL REPORT AVIATION

NTSB ID: ATL04IA156

Occurrence Date: 07/13/2004

Occurrence Type: Incident

$\Lambda \sim$	min	intrati	۰ <i>۱</i> م	~ f ~		いっっ
AΩ	mın	istrati	ve ir	1IO	rma	uon

Investigator-In-Charge (IIC)

Catherine E. Gagne

Additional Persons Participating in This Accident/Incident Investigation:

Jerry Brooks Atlanta FSDO - 11 College Park, GA

Terry Cox Ryan International Airlines Wichita, KS